

## Appendix 1 to Waverley Borough Council's CMB report on Off Street Car Parking Enforcement provision

### Option 1 (Do nothing)

'Do nothing' means no provision for off street car parking enforcement beyond the expiration of the current contract (30 September 2024).

- × This option would not contribute to fulfilling the Guildford Borough Council and Waverley Borough Council Partnership **vision or Strategic objectives** of the Transformation and Collaboration Programme and misses an opportunity to collaborate with Guildford Borough Council to deliver cost savings (Waverley's Corporate Strategy 2020-25) in the face of government funding challenges.
- × This option means no enforcement. This would also result in a significant risk of loss of revenue severely impacting the Council's ability to balance the budget and would also necessitate decommissioning costs.
- × The **savings** from not awarding a CEO contract would be far outweighed by loss of income through non-compliant parking in car parks.
- × This could result in leaving **car parks open without enforcement**, resulting in cars parking illegally, cash machines/signage may be damaged etc. especially without the monitoring which comes with enforcement. Otherwise, **car parks would be shut** which would result in less parking options for residents and would affect town centre shops, and decommissioning costs.
- × Waverley Borough Council would not receive **joint monitoring** benefit from shared executive head of service.

## **Option 2 (Do Minimum)**

'Do minimum' would involve Waverley Borough Council entering into a 2 year Framework Agreement with NSL.

- ✦ Legal advice have indicated that this framework **does not apply** to civil enforcement so a full tender would be the only option.

### Option 3 (Do More)

'Do more' would involve Guildford Borough Council managing Waverley Borough Council's compliance enforcement officer team under an agreed arrangement.

- ✓ Fulfils 4 out of 5 of the Guildford Borough Council and Waverley Borough Council **Partnership vision** as set out in appendix 2.
- ✓ Meets 4 out of 5 of the Transformation and Collaboration **Strategic Objectives** as set out in appendix 3.
- ✓ Demonstrates **ownership of change** in the face of government funding challenge and embeds change culture.
- ✓ Fulfills criteria of Waverley's **Corporate Strategy 2020-25** "we will [...] be working collaboratively with other Surrey councils to secure the best outcome for our residents both financially and in terms of locally focused services." This arrangement also creates a more "accountable" team.
- ✓ **Strategic Direction:** This is the preferred option of Guildford Borough Council and Waverley Borough Council's Executive Head of Commercial Services with a view to strengthen the relationships between the two car parking teams and create a larger enforcement team where there are greater operational efficiencies and resilience. This is supported by the Transformation and Collaboration Programme Board (**T&CP Board**).
- ✓ **Mitigation of Potential Future Costs:** Collaboration with Guildford Borough Council creates a larger more resilient team. In addition it increases our market presence offering greater value when procuring for car parking infrastructure.
- ✓ **Civil enforcement officers:** Guildford Borough Council providing civil enforcement is best value for money on like for like basis.
- ✓ **Increased resilience:** The councils will share a parking compliance enforcement officer team. If an officer is ill, there will be a larger pool of people to cover, resulting in less dropped PCNs. Data sharing between councils will be managed under the agreed arrangement. Joint performance monitoring (from shared Executive Head of Service) will be used to review staff wellbeing and evaluate improved work efficiencies.

#### Option 4 (Do Most)

'Do most' involves Waverley Borough Council (or both councils) re-tendering the contract to multiple contractors (the "status-quo").

- × **Waverley's Corporate Strategy 2020-25** outlines a vision of "a financially sound Waverley, with infrastructure and resilient services fit for future." It is possible that best value for money could be achieved by re-tendering, and a traditional tender would provide benchmarking, however under advice from procurement it is unfair to ask a contractor to undertake a tender exercise if another option is a favourable route to market in the report. This is a waste of their time and resources. Under advice from procurement, legal and finance teams, the best way to accurately financial model this option involves taking the previous budget (based on a successful tender) and adjusting for inflation. This has been assessed in the main report (section 11 – Financial Implications). It was found that option 3 had two different options depending on the outcome of the TUPE process. Option A would be budget neutral (ie comparable to tendering), whilst offering additional benefits such as increased resilience. Option B would provide cost savings compared to the budget or re-tendering.
- × This option would not fulfil the Guildford Borough Council and Waverley Borough Council Partnership **vision** or Strategic **objectives** of the Transformation and Collaboration programme.
- × Passing an opportunity to collaborate with Guildford Borough Council would indicate **lack of ownership** of the change required in the face of government funding challenge.
- × Loss of collaboration opportunity to deliver cost savings, as recommended in **Waverley's Corporate Strategy 2024-24**.
- × **Time:** A competitive tender is unlikely to be achievable within the timeframes, even with an additional 6 month NSL contract. This process would take up to 18 months.

## Option 5 (Do Something Else)

'Do something else' involves Waverley Borough Council creating an in house compliance enforcement team.

- × **Waverley's Corporate Strategy 2020-25** outlines a vision of "a financially sound Waverley, with infrastructure and resilient services fit for future." It is possible that best value for money could be achieved with an in house service, but this would present a risk to Waverley with the set up costs of a new service that has never been delivered internally before.
- × This option would not fulfil the Guildford Borough Council and Waverley Borough Council **Partnership vision** or Strategic **objectives** of the Transformation and Collaboration programme.
- × Passing an opportunity to collaborate with Guildford Borough Council could indicate **lack of ownership** of the change required in the face of government funding challenge.
- × Waverley Borough Council would be starting this service **from scratch** whilst Guildford Borough Council have a proven track record of enforcement for Waverley Borough Council.
- × Loss of collaboration opportunity to deliver cost savings, as recommended in **Waverley's Corporate Strategy 2020-25**.
- × **Strategic Direction:** This option would be to be high risk for Waverley Borough Council. It would include increased set-up costs as there is currently a lack of internal back office structure.
- × As a stand alone operator the **resilience** of the team will be **low**. With the small team size staff illness could reduce the amount of PCNs issues
- × There will be additional costs to Waverley to **set up** the necessary back office systems. for a fully in house service. It would also attract greater employment risk as the staff would be directly employed.
- × **Risk:** Recruitment of an in-house team and set-up of the equipment required for an in-house team would be costly and put Waverley Borough Council at performance risk as they have not done this service previously. Vehicles, communications, body worn cameras, office and stationary supplies would need to be costed. Staff recruitment may be unsuitable to Waverley Borough Council due to ongoing costs e.g. pensions, IT, HR, sick pay and pensions.

**Acronyms:**

CEOs = Compliance Enforcement Officers

EHoS = Executive Head of Service

PCN = Penalty Charge Notices

T&CP = Transformation and Collaboration Programme

TUPE = Transfer of Undertakings (Protection of Employment)